

any more until ye shall go to Ohio," (183), but the rest of the plates never were translated. (184)

When Cowdery and perhaps Rigdon importune their partner in fraud to be elevated to the prophetic office, Smith resists with a revelation in which God is made to say: "No one shall be appointed to receive commandments and revelations in this church, excepting my servant, Joseph Smith, Jr." (185). Similar revelations seem to have been necessary more than once. (186)

Finally the pressure became too hard to bear, and a revelation was procured in which God, in contradiction of his former declarations, one of which is above quoted, appoints Sidney Rigdon "to receive the oracles for the whole church." (187) And not neglecting the equal rights of the "prophet's" brother, God declares: "I appoint unto him (Hyrum Smith) that he may be a prophet, seer, and a revelator unto my church, as well as my servant Joseph." (188). Both men were, accordingly, "ordained" each a "prophet, seer, and revelator." (189). Thus are even the gods made to eat their own words at the behest of the conspirators, who quarrel in their division of the glory and the gold.

One more incident of this sort will suffice. In February, 1831, Smith received the first of several revelations directing the brethren to provide a home. In part it reads as follows:

It is mete that my servant Joseph Smith, Jun., should have a house built in which to live and translate. And again, it is mete that my servant Sidney Rigdon shall live as seemeth him good, inasmuch as he keepeth my commandments. (190)

Of course, living "as seemeth him good" was to Sidney Rigdon hardly a fair equivalent for a house and lot. Had he not made Smith a "prophet, seer, and revelator," and could he not also unmake him? Why, then, should Sidney Rigdon submit to any unfair division of the spoils of the prophetic office? He didn't.

The above revelation was received while Rigdon was absent from Kirtland. Upon his return he went to the meeting-house where an expectant throng awaited him in anticipation of one of his entrancing sermons, but Rigdon failed to go to the speaker's stand, and instead paced back and forth through the house. The "Prophet Joseph" being absent from Kirtland, Father Smith requested Rigdon to speak. In a tone of excitement Rigdon replied (and who will say it was not spoken as by one having authority): "The keys of the Kingdom are rent from the church, and there shall be no prayer put up in this house this day." "Oh, no; I hope not," gasped Father Smith. "I tell you they are," rejoined "Elder Rigdon." The brethren stared and turned pale, and the sisters in anguish cried aloud for relief. "I tell you again," said Sidney, with much feeling, "the keys of the Kingdom are taken from you, and you never will have them again until you build me a new house."

Amid tumultuous excitement on the part of the sisters, "Brother Hyrum" left the meeting to bring "Joseph the Prophet," who was in a neighboring settlement. On their return next day the "brethren" and "sisters" were gathered in anticipation of important happenings. Joseph mounted the rostrum and informed the assembly that they were laboring under a great mistake; that the church had not transgressed. Speaking of the lost keys, he said: "I myself hold the keys of this last dispensation, and will forever hold them, both in time and in eternity; so set your hearts at rest upon that point; all is right."

I continue to quote from an account written by the "prophet's" mother, relating just what they desire the world to believe happened immediately after:

"He (Joseph Smith) then went on and preached a comforting discourse, after which he appointed a council to sit the next day, by which Sidney Rigdon was tried for having lied in the name of the Lord. In this council Joseph told him he must suffer for what he had done; that he would be delivered over to the buffetings of satan, who would handle him as one man handleth another; that the less priesthood he had the better it would be for him, and that it would be well for him to give up his license. This council Sidney complied with, yet he had to suffer for his folly, for, according to his own account, he was dragged out of bed by the devil three times in one night, by the heels." Mother Lucy Smith doubtfully adds: "Whether this be true or not, one thing is certain. His contrition of soul was as great as a man could well live through." (191). The last sentence shows beyond dispute that Mother Lucy had her doubts about this silly story she has just narrated, and, of course, we are entitled to similar doubts.

What really did happen is made very plain by subsequent occurrences. Smith and Rigdon got together, patched up their differences by an agreement that Rigdon should have a house if he would restore the "keys" to the last dispensation, and desist from executing his threats to smash the "kingdom," and for the sake of its wholesome influence upon others he must play penitent and humble. As evidence of this conclusion we point to the story of this transaction as quoted above from Mother Lucy's life of the "prophet," and the two following sections of a revelation announced by Smith under date of August, 1831:

Behold, verily I say unto you, I the Lord am not pleased with my servant Sidney Rigdon. He exalted himself in his heart and received not my counsel, but grieved the Spirit. Let my servants Joseph Smith, Jun., and Sidney Rigdon seek them a house as they are taught through prayer by the Spirit. (192)

It is needless to add they each received a house, and both stood for many years, and perhaps even to this day, side by side, and both built according to the same plans. (193)

#### Concluding Comment.

The case, so far as the production of evidence is concerned, must now be considered closed. The actors in this fraud are all dead, and upon the precise question here discussed no new evidence is likely to be discovered. All the evidence directly affecting either side of the question has been introduced and reviewed.

When, as here, we are investigating a case dependent upon circumstantial evidence, we must judge the evidence as a whole. No one circumstance out of many connected ones ever established the ultimate fact. The converse of this proposition is equally true. You cannot show the insufficiency of the evidence by demonstrating that any one circumstance, if it stood alone, would be equally consistent with some other theory than the one in support of which it is cited. The evidentiary circumstances must be viewed as a whole, each in the light of its relation to all the rest. Thus viewed, the circumstantial evidence is strong just in proportion as the circumstances related to, and consistent with, as the theories advocated are numerous. In the argument under consideration the circumstantial facts are so numerous, and gathered from so many disconnected sources, corroborated by so many admissions from the accused conspirators and their defenders, that it is utterly impossible to believe them all to have come into being as a mere matter of accidental concomitance.

Let us put the defenders of the divinity of Mormonism to a test on this matter by inviting them to make an equally good case of circumstantial evidence based upon established fact, all tending to show some other human origin for the Book of Mormon than that here advocated. Inability to do so means that such an array of concurring facts cannot be duplicated in support of any other theory than the one here advocated. If, as must now be admitted, the concurrence of so very many facts can best be explained by the conclusions here contended for, then that is a more believable, a more rational conviction than one which of necessity requires belief in an assumed and unprovable miracle. That explanation which takes the least for granted is always the one adopted by the sanest person. Bearing in mind these truths, let us briefly review a portion of the most salient features of the argument.

From the uncontradicted evidence of witnesses, practically all of whom are disinterested and who in most circumstances of great evidentiary weight are corroborated by authorized church publications, we have established beyond cavil, and I am sure to the satisfaction of all thinking minds untainted by mysticism, and whose vision is unobscured, that the following are thoroughly established facts:

Solomon Spaulding, between 1812 and 1816, outlined and then rewrote a novel, attempting therein to account for the American Indian by Israelitish origin. The first outline of this story, now at Oberlin college, had no direct connection with the Book of Mormon, and was never claimed to be connected with it, and such connection was expressly disclaimed as early as 1834. The rewritten story, entitled "Manuscript Found," was by Spaulding twice left with a publisher, whence it was stolen under circumstances which then led Spaulding to suspect Sidney Rigdon, who long after was the first conspicuous convert of Mormonism; that Rigdon, through his great intimacy with the publishers' employees, had opportunity to steal it, and that after Spaulding's death, and years before the advent of Mormonism, Rigdon had in his possession such a manuscript and exhibited it, with the statement that it was Spaulding's. Through Parley P. Pratt, Rigdon and Smith were brought into relation, and the latter made the prophet of the "Dispensation of the Fullness of Times," the discoverer, translator, and, according to his own designation, the "Author and Proprietor" (194) of the Book of Mormon. This connection is established by the most convincing circumstantial evidence, taken wholly from authorized Mormon publications; it is shown that Rigdon foreknew the coming, and in a general way the contents of the Book of Mormon; that both Rigdon and Pratt were, according to some of their contradictory accounts, converted to Mormonism with such miraculous suddenness and without substantial investigation that when this, coupled with the contradictory accounts of these important events and their attempts at concealing the suddenness of their conversion, all compel a conviction of their participation in a scheme of religious fraud.

Upon the question of plagiarism, we may profitably add a brief summary of the points of identity between the peculiar features shown to be common to Spaulding's novel and the Book of Mormon. In Spaulding's first outline of the story it pretended to be ancient

American history, attempting to explain the origin of part of the aboriginals of this continent, all translated from ancient writings found in a stone box. It recounts the wars of extermination of two factions, tells of the collecting of armies and of slaughters which were a physical impossibility to those uncivilized people who were without any modern methods of transporting troops or army supplies. After two revisions, one by Spaulding and a second by Smith, Rigdon & Co., the above general outline still describes equally well the Book of Mormon.

Leaving the first blocking-out of his novel unfinished, Spaulding resolved to change his plot by dating the story further back and by attempting to imitate the Old Scripture style, so as to make it seem more ancient. Spaulding's determination to date his novel further back probably suggested changing the roll of parchment which, according to the Oberlin manuscript, was found in a stone box, to golden plates. Some time after 1820 some one pretended to have found a Golden Bible in Canada (195). If Spaulding, in rewriting the story, did not make the change, this incident may have suggested such a change to Smith and his fellow-frauds.

Spaulding, in his attempt at imitating Bible phraseology, had repeated so ridiculously often the words "it came to pass," that both in Ohio and Pennsylvania the neighbors to whom he read his manuscript nicknamed him "Old Come-to-pass." In the Book of Mormon, though professedly an abridgement, the same phrase is uselessly repeated several thousand times, and a bungling effort at imitating the style of Bible writers is apparent all through it.

Spaulding's existence was contemporaneous with Masonic riots, and he harbored a sentiment against all secret societies (196), which has also been carried through into the Book of Mormon.

The uncontradicted and unimpeached evidence of many witnesses is explicit that the historical portions of both the "Manuscript Found" and the Book of Mormon are the same, and much of the religious matter interpolated is in the exact phraseology of King James's translation of the Bible. We find also many names of places, persons and tribes to be identical in the "Manuscript Found" and the Book of Mormon. Some of the names were taken from the Bible, others would be known only to the students of American antiquities, among whom was Spaulding, and still others were unheard of until coined by Spaulding. The names proven to be common to both are Nephi, Lehi, Mormon, Nephites, Lamanites, Laban, Zarahemla and Amlicites.

Add to this the very novel circumstance that in both accounts one of two contending armies placed upon the forehead of its soldiers a red mark that they might distinguish friends from enemies, and the new and characteristic features common to both are too numerous to admit of any explanation except that herein contended for, viz: That the Book of Mormon is a plagiarism from Spaulding's novel, the "Manuscript Found," and is the product of conscious fraud on the part of Sidney Rigdon, Parley Parker Pratt, Joseph Smith and others, which fraud was prompted wholly by a love of notoriety and money.

#### NOTES.

151. This ends the evidence taken from Howe's "Mormonism Unveiled," chapter 19.
152. "The Spaulding Story Examined and Exposed," by page 10.
153. "Who Wrote the Book of Mormon," 6.
154. See also "Who Wrote the Book of Mormon," 6-7.
155. Bennett's "Mormonism Exposed," 123-4-1842.
156. "Rise and Fall of Nauvoo," 443. Bancroft's "History of Utah," 179.
157. Doctrine and Covenants, 84:89.
158. Doctrine and Covenants, 58:35, 36.
159. Doctrine and Covenants, 63:40.
160. Doctrine and Covenants, 81:104.
161. Doctrine and Covenants, 96:45. Supplement 14 Millennial Star, 80.
162. Doctrine and Covenants, 10:24.
163. Doctrine and Covenants, 119:1.
164. Doctrine and Covenants, 24:9.
165. Doctrine and Covenants, 24:3.
166. Doctrine and Covenants, 43:14.
167. Doctrine and Covenants, 81:90.
168. Doctrine and Covenants, 63:48.
169. Doctrine and Covenants, 19:26.
170. "Origin, Rise and Progress of Mormonism," 12.
171. 15 Millennial Star, 308.
172. "Mormon Portraits," 16.
173. Doctrine and Covenants, Sec. 94.
174. 15 Millennial Star, 520.
175. 16 Millennial Star, 151.
176. "Gleanings by the Way," 324. Sometimes Smith was cashier and Rigdon president. "Prophet of Palmyra," 135.
177. 19 Millennial Star, 343. 29 Millennial Star, 106-216-246. "Mormonism and Mormons," 335.
178. Deseret News, April 8, 1857, p. 36.
179. 2 Journal of Discourses, 128. 7 Deseret News, 115.
180. Statement of Warren Parrish, copied in "An Exposure of Mormonism," 19. Messenger and Advocate, January, 1837, copied in "Prophet of Palmyra," 124. Deseret News, December 21, 1864, vol. 14, p. 34, says "under the direction of the prophet."
181. Statement of Warren Parrish, copied in "An Exposure of Mormonism," 11.
182. Doctrine and Covenants, 6:91.
183. Doctrine and Covenants, Sec. 27.
184. 19 Journal of Discourses, 28-216-218. "Reminiscences of Joseph the Prophet," 14.
185. Doctrine and Covenants, 28:2.
186. Doctrine and Covenants, 43:8.
187. Doctrine and Covenants, 124:126.
188. Doctrine and Covenants, 124:24. 15 Millennial Star, 360.
189. 26 Millennial Star, 550 as to Rig-

don, and p. 373 as to Hyrum Smith. It is now claimed that Smith had conferred upon all the apostles "all the power, priesthood and authority ever conferred upon himself." 1 Journal of Discourses, 206. 19 Journal of Discourses, 124. See also Melchior and Aronic Herald, February, 1850. 5 Millennial Star, 194. 68 Semi-Annual Conference, 70.

190. Doctrine and Covenants, 41, 7 and 8.
191. Mother Lucy's life of "Joseph Smith, the Prophet," 195 and 196. As to Rigdon's declaration that the keys were gone, see also 14 Deseret News, 31. December 21, 1864. As to Rigdon's being dragged out of bed, see also History of the Mormons, 53.
192. Doctrine and Covenants, 63:55 and 65.
193. "Gleanings by the Way," 332.
194. Smith designates himself as the "Author and Proprietor" of God's word. In the title page of the Book of Mormon, also in the testimony of the witnesses as it appears in the first edition, since which time both have been altered. See also Evening and Morning Star, 117.
195. Braden-Kelly Debate, 55.
196. Howe's "Mormonism Unveiled," 288.

#### EMIGRATION DAM AND DITCH CO.

Notice is hereby given that at a meeting of the directors held November 16, 1907, an assessment of three dollars per share was levied upon the capital stock of the company, payable December 29, 1907, to Charles K. Johnson, treasurer, at residence, Twenty-third East between Tenth and Eleventh South streets, Salt Lake City, Utah. Any stock upon which this assessment may remain unpaid on the day above specified will be delinquent and advertised for sale at public auction, and unless payment is made before will be sold on the 2nd day of January, 1908, to pay the delinquent assessment, together with costs of advertising and expenses of sale.

CHARLES K. JOHNSON,  
Secretary and Treasurer.

12575

The most beautiful thing in the world is a diamond. It is also the only thing that does not deteriorate by use and on account of scarcity grows more valuable each year.

You buy at bottom prices when you get your jewels of us.

ESTABLISHED  
1862  
**Park's**  
JEWELRY STORE  
170  
MAIN ST.  
SALT LAKE CITY, UTAH

#### The Puzzling Man.

If in doubt as to what to give some gentleman relative or friend, consider a safety razor. That is part of the equipment that nearly every man needs. We handle the EVER-READY SAFETY RAZOR. They are guaranteed to give entire satisfaction in every way.  
Price \$1.00 Each.

**DAYTON DRUG CO.**  
Cor. 2nd South and State Sts.

**SALT LAKE PHOTO SUPPLY CO.**

142 MAIN STREET.

A full line of professional mounts and supplies.

Kodaks and Developing.

**Columbia Phonograph Co. (General)**  
327-329 So. Main St.  
Graphophones, Records and Supplies.  
Bell, 3995. Ind., 1013.  
Only Exclusive Talking Machine House in State.

**PIANOS, \$50.00 and Up.  
ORGANS, \$25.00 and Up.  
BEESLEY MUSIC CO.,**  
46 South Main St.

**Royal Baking Powder**  
ABSOLUTELY PURE